ase 2:12-md-0232 718 Page 1 of 18 PageID #: 18564 AHBII

W. Seaborn Ashley 1947–2001

> J. RALPH BEAIRD 1925–2014

E. DAVISON BURCH of counsel

LEANNA B. PITTARD of counsel

GARY B. BLASINGAME

Henry G. Garrard III

Andrew J. Hill III

Thomas H. Rogers Jr.

MICHAEL A. MORRIS

James B. Matthews III

RICHARD W. SCHMIDT

EVAN W. JONES

GEORGE W. BROWN III

DAVID A. DISMUKE

MOLLY K. TALLEY

JOSH B. WAGES

Thomas F. Hollingsworth III

ALVIN L. BRIDGES

Lee S. Atkinson

MICHAEL RUPPERSBURG

PATRICK H. GARRARD

Sara E. Schramm

THOMAS J. JEFFORDS

HALEY C. ROBISON

P.O. Box 832 Athens, Georgia 30603 440 College Avenue, Suite 320 Athens, GA 30601 Phone 706.354.4000 Fax 706.353.0873

> 1021 Parkside Commons Suite 104 Greensboro, GA 30642 Phone 706.453.7139 Fax 706.453.7842

PLEASE REPLY TO ATHENS ADDRESS Henry G. Garrard, III hgarrard@bbga.com

September 13, 2018

Sent Via E-Mail

Lee Balefsky

Kline & Specter, PC

Lee.Balefsky@KlineSpecter.com; danielle.serad@klinespecter.com

RE: Transvaginal Mesh MDL Common Benefit Fee and Cost Committee Preliminary Written Recommendation

Dear Mr. Balefsky:

We are writing to you on behalf of the Common Benefit Fee and Cost Committee appointed by the Honorable Joseph R. Goodwin with regard to MDL Nos. 2187, 2325, 2326, 2327, 2387, 2440, and 2511 (the "FCC"). At this time, the FCC has completed its Initial Review of your fee submissions and your final time and expense submission as accompanied by your affidavit in accordance with the Fee Committee Protocol established by the Court. For those firms who sought an opportunity to be heard regarding common benefit fees and expenses, those meetings have been completed. There were approximately 900,000 hours submitted to the FCC for review. The FCC has carefully reviewed each submission and has met with the co-leads of the MDL to discuss the contributions made by each firm to the MDL common benefit. For those firms that did not object to the hours and expense as delivered to you, the FCC deems that you have no objection regarding your hours or expenses for consideration.

The FCC now issues its Preliminary Written Recommendation with regard to the allocation of fees and expenses. The FCC currently recommends that your firm receive consideration for 9,402.19 hours of time and receive \$3,745,000.00 for common benefit. Additionally, the FCC currently recommends that your firm receive \$667,584.48 in reimbursement for held expenses that were for the common benefit of MDL claimants, plus the reimbursement of \$350,000.00 which was paid by your firm as an assessment in the MDL. The dollar amounts identified herein for the compensation for your contribution to the common benefit are based on the assumption by the FCC that there will be approximately \$344,000,000.00 available for payment of common benefit contributions at the time of the first distribution. The FCC also anticipates an additional amount of approximately \$49,000,000.00 will be paid for the reimbursement of held costs and MDL assessments in the first distribution.

Anapol Weiss. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. The Fee Committee recommends reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments.

Anderson Law Office. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 22,209.68 hours and \$666,993.81 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's in-person presentation to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$7,210,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$666,993.81 in expenses.

Andrus Wagstaff. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 29,563.85 hours and \$505,275.50 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's in-person presentation to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the BSC MDL, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$8,715,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$505,275.50 in expenses.

Ashcraft Gerel. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 773.40 hours and \$7,200.40 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$174,667.50, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$7,200.40 in expenses.

Aylstock, Witkin, Kries & Overholtz, PLLC. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 43,932.50 hours and \$1,108,942.51 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's inperson presentation to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$27,125,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$1,108,942.51 in expenses.

Babbitt Johnson Osborne & LaClainche, P.A. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 4,308.80 hours and \$200,816.91 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$1,330,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$200,816.91 in expenses.

Baron and Blue. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 436.05 hours and \$33,687.74 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$137,375, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$33,687.74 in expenses.

Baron & Budd, P.C. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. The Fee Committee recommends reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments.

Beasley, Allen, Crow, Methvin, Portis & Miles, P.C. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 22,295.45 hours and \$308,978.75 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's inperson presentation to the Fee Committee and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$5,250,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's outstanding \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$308,978.75 in expenses.

Bell Law Firm. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 3,724.59 hours and \$6,253.68 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$814,159.50, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$6,253.68 in expenses.

Bernstein Liebhard, LLP. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 3,951.50 hours and \$102,445.59 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and analysis of the firm's contribution to the common benefit of the Ethicon MDL, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$942,331.25, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$102,445.59 in expenses.

Bertram & Graf. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 401.50 hours and \$12,404.24 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$83,580.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$12,404.24 in expenses.

Blasingame, Burch, Garrard & Ashley, PC. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 63,719.30 hours and \$9,545,824.63 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's in-person presentation to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$56,700,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$9,545,824.63 in expenses.

Blizzard & Nabers, LLP. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 3,693.90 hours and \$241,576.56 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$1,435,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$241,576.56 in expenses.

Burke Harvey, LLC. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 349.40 hours and \$14,197.66 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$96,915.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$14,197.66 in expenses.

Burnett Law Firm. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 10,490.35 hours and \$10,941.33 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's in-person presentation to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$5,075,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$10,941.33 in expenses.

Carey Danis & Lowe, LLP. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 8,840.80 hours. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$700,000.00.

Chaffin Luhana, LLP. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 301.57 hours and \$1,578.10 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$58,170.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$1,578.10 in expenses.

Clark, Love & Hutson, G.P. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 47,226.50 hours and \$4,230,319.61 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's in-person presentation to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$45,500,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$4,230,319.61 in expenses.

Cohen, Placitella & Roth, PC. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 614.50 hours and \$71,444.10 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's in-person presentation to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$343,105.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$71,444.10 in expenses.

Davis & Crump, L.L.P. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 11,381.65 hours and \$120,902.90 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$2,345,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$120,902.90 in expenses.

Davis, Bethune & Jones, L.L.C. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 1,397.80 hours and \$346,652.48 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's in-person presentation to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$351,844.85, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$346,652.48 in expenses.

Doyle Lowther, LLP. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 1,150.90 hours and \$2,751.93 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$210,026.25, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$2,751.93 in expenses.

Edwards Kirby, LLP. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 499.50 hours. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$157,360.00.

Evers & Preston. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 2,512.35 hours and the firm did not submit expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$472,500.00.

Fibich, Leebron, Copeland & Briggs. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 10,124.26 hours and \$155,301.31 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$3,325,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$155,301.31 in expenses.

Fleming Nolen Jez, LLP. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 8,378.07 hours and \$15,862.79 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$1,435,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$15,862.79 in expenses.

Frankovitch, Anetakis, Simon, Decapio & Pearl, LLP. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 1,524.75 hours and \$28,892.78 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's inperson presentation to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$1,610,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$28,892.78 in expenses.

Frees & Goss, PLLC, and Matthews & Associates. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 45,346.48 hours and \$1,286,842.79 in expenses. The firms contributed \$700,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavits, the firms' in-person presentations to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$15,470,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firms' \$700,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$1,286,842.79 in expenses.

Girard Gibbs. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 67.26 hours and \$4,337.32 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$15,907.50, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$4,337.32 in expenses.

Goza Honnold. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 1,305.60 hours and \$17,629.76 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$410,655.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$17,629.76 in expenses.

Greene Ketchum Farrell Bailey & Tweel, L.L.P. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 4,392.40 hours and \$26,653.16 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$2,415,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$26,653.16 in expenses.

Gustafson Gluek. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 725.00 hours and \$1,707.61 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$158,900.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$1,707.61 in expenses.

Heninger Garrison Davis, LLC. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 784.6 hours and \$3,639.07 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$177,292.50, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$3,639.07 in expenses.

Herman Gerel. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 907.45 hours and \$25,861.53 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$173,670.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$25,861.53 in expenses.

Herman & Katz. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 699.00 hours and \$15,810.91 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$119,175.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$15,810.91 in expenses.

Hersh and Hersh. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 1,005.60 hours and \$5,114.80 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's in-person presentation to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$241,255.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$5,114.80 in expenses.

Hissey Kientz. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 1,145.90 hours and \$2,619.91 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$306,978.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$2,619.91 in expenses.

Hunt & Lees, L.C. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 261.70 hours and \$14,895.21 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$82,425.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$14,895.21 in expenses.

Irpino Avin & Hawkins Law Firm. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 3,285.80 hours and a total of \$6,999.14 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$785,074.50, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$6,999.14 in expenses.

Johnson Becker, PLLC. The Fee Committee recognized a total 3,126.40 hours and a total of \$34,897.65 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$603,092.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$34,897.65 in expenses.

Junell & Associates. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 526.90 hours. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$165,970.00.

Keith Miller Butler. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 3,926.30 hours and \$17,151.53 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$904,638.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$17,151.53 in expenses.

Kell Lampin, L.L.C. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 1,609.90 hours and \$43,541.16 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$327,101.25, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$43,541.16 in expenses.

Kline & Specter, P.C. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 9,402.19 hours and \$667,584.48 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's in-person presentation to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$3,745,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$667,584.48 in expenses.

Lamb Firm, LLC. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. The Fee Committee recommends reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments.

Laminack, Pirtle & Martines, L.L.P. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 756.75 hours and \$37,286.70 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$539,035.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$37,286.70 in expenses.

The Lanier Law Firm. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 3,660.64 hours and \$15,671.35 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$654,228.75, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$15,671.35 in expenses.

Levin, Papantonio, Thomas, Mitchell, Rafferty, Proctor, P.A. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 1,975.08 hours and \$41,058.32 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$383,643.75, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$41,058.32 in expenses.

Levin Simes, LLP. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 14,298.14 hours and \$484,095.89 in expenses. The firm contributed \$400,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's in-person presentation to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$5,110,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$400,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$484,095.89 in expenses.

Lockridge Grindal Nauen. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 15,871.50 hours and \$79,703.00 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's in-person presentation to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$6,405,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$79,703.00 in expenses.

Lopez McHugh. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 255.58 hours and \$3,293.31 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$43,601.25, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$3,293.31 in expenses.

Lyon Firm. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 232.00 hours. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$43,601.25.

Mazie Slater Katz & Freeman. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 19,482.75 hours and \$1,815,034.41 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's in-person presentation to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$6,020,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$1,815,034.41 in expenses.

Meyers & Flowers, LLC. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 1,924.80 hours and \$32,328.06 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$454,728.75, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$32,328.06 in expenses.

Miller Firm, LLC. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. The Fee Committee recommends reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments.

The Monsour Law Firm. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 13,267.75 hours and \$232,499.22 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$4,515,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$232,499.22 in expenses.

Moody Law Firm, Inc. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 4,125.97 hours and \$10,555.33 in expenses. The firm contributed \$250,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$844,312.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$250,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$10,555.33 in expenses.

Morgan & Morgan, PA. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 513.54 hours and \$961.36 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$101,771.25, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$961.36 in expenses.

Mostyn Law Firm P.C. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 677.65 hours and \$4,531.84 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$213,465.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$4,531.84 in expenses.

Motley Rice, LLC. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 60,253.34 hours and \$2,927,113.91 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's in-person presentation to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$49,000,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$2,927,113.91 in expenses.

Mueller Law Firm. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 11,846.40 hours and \$263,115.43 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's in-person presentation to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$4,760,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$263,115.43 in expenses.

NastLaw, L.L.C. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 2,102.30 hours and \$20,515.89 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$399,813.75, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$20,515.89 in expenses.

Nations Law Firm. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 65.50 hours and \$30,231.86 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$15,487.50, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$30,231.86 in expenses.

Neblett, Beard & Arsenault. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 765.12 hours and \$8,523.52 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$137,340.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$8,523.52 in expenses.

The Oliver Law Group, P.C. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 2,259.30 hours and \$17,040.78 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$436,170.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$17,040.78 in expenses.

Osborne & Associates. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 740.80 hours. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$233,345.00.

Paul Sadler Law Firm. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 211.10 hours and \$2,332.07 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$130,704.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$2,332.07 in expenses.

Perdue & Kidd. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 3,295.80 hours and \$68,707.62 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's in-person presentation to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$1,785,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$68,707.62 in expenses.

Piscitelli Law Firm. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 54.30 hours. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$12,836.25.

Potts Law Firm. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 19,287.84 hours and \$210,083.09 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's in-person presentation to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$6,475,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$210,083.09 in expenses.

Pritzker Hageman, P.A. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 116.10 hours and \$6,455.24 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's in-person presentation to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$25,436.25, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$6,455.24 in expenses.

Reilly Pozner. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 7,148.30 hours and \$225,913.39 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$2,520,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$225,913.39 in expenses.

Restaino Law, LLC. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 1,323.60 hours. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$264,521.25.

Robins Cloud, LLP. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 502.90 hours and \$33,552.71 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$145,390.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$33,552.71 in expenses.

Robinson Calcagnie, Inc. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 32.00 hours and \$13,518.39 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$7,560.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$13,518.39 in expenses.

Salim Beasley, L.L.C. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 5,729.07 hours and \$107,219.58 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$2,170,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$107,219.58 in expenses.

The Sanders Firm. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 672.30 hours and \$102,554.64 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's in-person presentation to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$101,773.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$102,554.64 in expenses.

Saunders & Walker, PA. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 125.45 hours and \$134.64 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$29,662.50, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$134.64 in expenses.

Schroeder Law Office. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 20.40 hours (the majority of Ms. Schroeder's time was submitted while she was an attorney at Fleming, Nolen & Jez). The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$4,830.00.

Seeger Weiss, LLP. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 543.25 hours and \$98,011.34 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$101,771.25, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$98,011.34 in expenses.

Simmons Browder Gianaris Angelides & Barnerd, L.L.C. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 2,987.67 hours and \$23,049.47 in expenses. The firm contributed \$250,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$393,498.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$250,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$23,049.47 in expenses.

Simmons Hanly Conroy, L.L.C. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 351.90 hours and \$18,754.07 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$100,100.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$18,754.07 in expenses.

Sommers Schwartz, P.C. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 214.90 hours and \$5,042.70 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$36,330.00 and reimbursement of \$5,042.70 in expenses.

Taylor Martino. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 17.00 hours and \$49,903.58 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$4,016.25, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$49,903.58 in expenses.

Turning Point Litigation – **Mullins Duncan Harrell & Russell PLLC.** The Fee Committee recognized a total of 5,775.10 hours and \$10,799.05 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's in-person presentation to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$301,546.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$10,799.05 in expenses.

Verhine & Verhine. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 119.35. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$25,436.25.

Wagstaff & Cartmell, LLP. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 56,621.10 hours and \$1,634,637.93 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's in-person presentation to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$38,500,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$1,634,637.93 in expenses.

Waters & Kraus, L.L.P. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 414.60 hours. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$111,440.00.

Watts Guerra, LLP. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 2,837.70 hours and \$16,457.55 in expenses. The firm did not pay an assessment. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$484,627.50, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$16,457.55 in expenses.

Wexler Wallace, LLP. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 33,079.96 hours and \$420,171.37 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, the firm's in-person presentation to the Fee Committee, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$11,830,000.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$420,171.37 in expenses.

The Wilner Firm, P.A. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. The Fee Committee recommends reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments.

Wilson Law, PA. The Fee Committee recognized a total of 313.20 hours and \$1,421.43 in expenses. The firm contributed \$350,000.00 in assessments. Based on a complete review of the time and expense records, the Fee Affidavit, and evaluation of the firm's overall contribution to the common benefit of the MDLs, the Fee Committee recommends an allocation of \$82,390.00, plus reimbursement of the firm's \$350,000.00 in assessments, and reimbursement of \$1,421.43 in expenses.

The amounts discussed herein are the FCC's preliminary recommendation and are subject to change prior to the submission of the FCC's final written recommendation to the external review specialist, The Honorable Dan Stack. Please note that all amounts are proposed and are subject to the consideration and final decision of the MDL Court. The FCC anticipates that there will be subsequent distributions in the future. The FCC anticipates requesting that 70% of any additional funds received be distributed by the Court pro rata in accordance with the allocations made to applicant firms. In addition, the FCC anticipates that it will request that 30% of any additional funds be held pending further Order of the Court.

Each firm is receiving the basis for its allocation in accordance with the Fee Committee Protocol. Further, in accordance with the Fee Committee Protocol, attached to this letter are (1) the explanation of the basis of the allocation for your firm, and (2) an explanation of the time and expenses allowed by the FCC for every firm seeking compensation for common benefit. In making its Preliminary Written Recommendation, the FCC considered, over a period of two years, the factors set forth in the Orders regarding common benefit, including Section B (Criteria for Common Benefit Applications) of the Court's Order establishing common benefit compensation criteria for each of the firms seeking compensation. The FCC previously delivered to you those hours and expenses that the FCC identified as being disallowed for purposes of consideration for compensation through its delivery of Exhibits A, B and expenses at the conclusion of its Initial Review. The number of hours under consideration as common benefit was only one part of the evaluation process in regard to the FCC's Preliminary Written Recommendation. Based on the requirements of the Fee Committee Protocol, the FCC evaluated each firm using the same criteria and exercised its discretion in evaluating the degree to which the work and expense incurred by each firm furthered the common benefit of the litigation. To the extent a firm requested an opportunity to be heard by the FCC, the FCC has considered the information presented by firms and has incorporated its deliberations and decisions into its Preliminary Written Recommendation. Throughout its evaluation, the FCC was primarily focused on evaluating the contribution of each common benefit attorney to the outcome of the litigation.

If you accept the FCC's Preliminary Written Recommendation, you need take no further action. In accordance with the Fee Committee Protocol, if you wish to object to the preliminary written recommendation, you must notify the FCC on or before Friday, September 28, 2018, via email to the FCC Chairperson Henry Garrard at hgarrard@bbga.com. Any objection is limited to ten (10) pages. Upon timely notice to the FCC, your objection will be considered by the FCC prior to the issuance of the final written recommendation by the FCC.

Thank you for your prompt attention to the matters addressed herein.

Henry G. Garrard, III
Chairperson

The Baggett of purpose
Renee Baggett of purpose
Riley L. Burnett, Jr.
Thomas P. Cartmell of purpose
Clayton A. Clark of purpose
Clayton A. Clark of purpose

Riley L. Burnett, Jr.
Thomas P. Cartmell of purpose
Clayton A. Clark of purpose
Clayton A.

The Honorable Daniel J. Stack, Ret.
External Review Specialist

Yome M. Huhath In M.
Yvonne M. Flaherty with phonor

Carl N. Frankovitch with phonor

William H. McKee, Jr. with phonor

Joseph F. Rice with Manner